

PLIB Update

The PLIB majority continues to voice their scorn for use of herbicides with one board member continuing to make reference to herbicides as poisoning the lake. Progressive has made it clear there is no viable option for our lake that does not use herbicides in at least year one, followed by a controlled test of using weevils in years two thru five. As such, we are at an impasse and as a result, this board has made no meaningful progress for three months now. They are now in jeopardy of missing the deadline for getting the SAD set and on the spring tax assessment. If the board misses this window (late October) treatment in 2012 is in serious jeopardy.

Ironically, the board has reached out to Jennifer Jones from Lakeshore Environmental in pursuit of the Laminar Flow option, the only possible **BIOLOGICAL ONLY OPTION** remaining to them. Laminar Flow, as a EWM control agent, is in its infancy. Here in lies the anx and the crux of why Tony Groves from Progressive does not support Laminar Flow at this time. The first long term study with scientifically based statistically valid data will not be available for peer review before December, 2011. While the data we observed when touring a Michigan lake currently using Laminar Flow technology looked promising, it's akin to taking a drug that has shown promise in treating a serious ailment but has not been thoroughly reviewed by members of the medical community i.e. its peers before being approved/rejected by the FDA. Moreover, the cost of this option is 2 to 2.5 times the cost of the herbicide/weevil option approaching \$2,000,000 over a ten year period. Of further concern, the vendor is unwilling to warranty and guarantee their work i.e. will not specify a percentage of EWM reduction in year one, or year two or future treatment cost are free. However, they state emphatically that we will see a 50 percent reduction in EWM in year one. As a riparian who will be funding this clean-up, I personally, will not support a concept, especially one that is yet to be proven that it works in all cases unless the vendor provides those of us footing the bill with some form of guarantee or future treatments are free until they achieve the EWM reductions they make in their claims.

Further below is a summary of a tour of Indian Lake where one PLIB board member and a half dozen riparian's toured Indian Lake--the test lake for using Laminar Flow to treat EWM and the test case for Jennifer Jones Doctorate Thesis followed by last month's PLIB meeting notes. I am personally encouraged by what people saw at Indian Lake but following this path has its draw backs, most notably the cost, a lack of a guarantee at this point and very likely another year delay in treating our lake.

I am hopeful that if the Laminar Flow option is to be considered that the PLIB sends those of us footing the bill a letter asking which option we prefer to fund with our tax dollars and most important, they work out an acceptable guarantee to protect those of us footing the bill as Progressive has done with the herbicide/weevil option.

One last point, the FoPL put the PLIB on notice that if a viable plan is not in place by January 10, 2012 that we will proceed organizing an effort for those riparian's who wish to treat their bottom lands in early May, 2012 so at a minimum, we start treatment in 2012 vs. waiting yet another year. It is my hope that this action is not needed and the PLIB moves with a sense of urgency to insure a viable funded treatment program is implemented come spring 2012.

Rick Schweller "President FoPL"

INDIAN LAKE TRIP

On Monday, September 12, 2011, seven riparian owners made a trip to Indian Lake in Southwest Michigan to see how the Laminar Flow Aeration System worked. This trip was arranged by Ann Klebba and hosted by Jerry Donnley, President of the Indian Lake Association. Those that went were Justin Drago, John Beeson, Rosemary Consani, Ann Klebba, Dave Klebba, Cathy Freebairn, and Marilyn Smith. Our journey started at 6 A.M. and ended when we arrived back home after 11:30 P.M.

Indian Lake is approximately 500 acres with an average depth of 12 feet and the deepest areas being 22 feet. They have used many different methods to clean up their lake starting with dredging for 15 years (this was done to try to clear the lake of the muck and sediment that is prevalent in most lakes). After 15 years they decided that dredging was too expensive and were not achieving the results they wanted so that method was abandoned. When EWM hit their lake they tried harvesting for a few years before realizing that was only spreading the EWM. After harvesting was abandoned Indian Lake was treated with a full lake sonar treatment 6 years ago. This had the desired results of the EWM being taken down but they continued to have to spot treat as the beds came back each year as expected because as we all know, once EWM takes hold in a lake it can never be completely eradicated

Two years ago their association decided to try a pilot program with the Laminar Flow Aeration System on the south side of the lake. Prior to having Laminar Flow installed this area had not been treated for two years. The Laminar Flow treatment area consists of 88 acres with eleven diffusers (bubblers). The results have been amazing to say the least. In the first 45 days folks were amazed at the amount of EWM that was gone. By the end of the first year they saw a 50% reduction in EWM. They are now coming up on the end of the second year and have seen a 50% reduction of the remaining EWM in the pilot area. They have also lost a foot of muck and sediment off the bottom of the treatment area. We are in the process of getting the technical data that supports these claims, but on the surface, it looks encouraging.

On our trip around the lake we stopped at the property where the compressor was installed to check out the amount of noise that it put out. All in all I would say the noise is no more than a window air conditioning unit. The compressor is concealed in a big plastic tub with insulation packed around it and vents in the side. We discussed the possibility of erecting a wooden building with insulation for less noise. While we were off the boat checking out the compressor one of the neighbors walked over and invited us all over to his property to see how clear and clean his water was. He was quite proud of the fact that his EWM is just about gone and the muck was disappearing.

From this house we got back on the boat to check out the area where the diffusers were placed to see how much disruption there would be. We were almost to the first one before we could see the bubbles. We went around it and it did not disrupt the boat. We went across the bubbles and again it did not disrupt the boat – you could not even feel it. As we got further into the pilot area we stopped at another house where a lady came out to talk to us about her experiences with the Laminar Flow. She said that two years ago her kids and grandkids would not even go in the water around their dock because the muck was so bad and they would get tangled up in the weeds. As of the 12th of September you could see to be bottom of the lake – the EWM and

muck/sediment was gone from around her dock area and she has wonderful sandy bottoms. She said that this summer was the first time in years that her kids and grandkids had been in the lake.

Our trip on the lake ended with a question and answer session with Jennifer Jones, John Tucci, and Jerry Donnley. We left feeling renewed interest in the Laminar Flow Aeration System and an excitement that we haven't felt for quite a while. All in all it was a very beneficial and educational (but long) day.

Their lake has also been on a central sewer system for 18 years.

Rosemary Consani "VP FoPL"
Justin Dragoo "Director FoPL".

9/14/2011 PLIB MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Jim Tamlyn at 7:00 P.M.
Arden Bawkey made a motion to accept the minutes from the previous meeting – second by Elaine Bostwick – minutes were approved as written.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Ann Klebba gave a very detailed report on our trip to Indian Lake.
Marilyn Smith gave a brief report on the trip to Indian Lake.

CORRESPONDENCE:

An e-mail from Norma Mouch stating that the weeds have thinned out considerably.

CHAIRMAN'S REPORT:

None

APPEARANCES:

Kira Davis, Little Traverse Bay Bands of Odawa Indians: Kira gave a report on the grant that was received for the building of a boat wash station at the public launch on Paradise Lake. She is hopeful that the work will begin next year.

Tony Groves (Progressive AE): It would take 100,000 to 400,000 weevils per acre to have any hope of weevils taking care of our EWM problem – he said you do the math to figure out how much that would cost at about \$1.25 per weevil – and he does not think that even at those numbers they would be able to solve our problem.

He proposed that we use herbicides in year one only with a 100% warranty that the herbicides would knock back the EWM then start stocking weevils in years two through five.

He suggests that we keep \$5,000 per year allotted for the maintenance of the boat wash station.

Funding for the herbicide treatment would be assessed for two years and weevils for years 3 through 5.

Unit of assessment for this would be \$426 for years one and two and \$208 for years three through five.

He still does not support Laminar Flow for Paradise Lake.

Paul asked Jim Tamlyn if he would ask Cheboygan County for a donation to help pay for treating Paradise Lake. Jim said he would ask – *(This is important as we are not allowed to treat any portion of the lake residing in Hebron Township unless either the Township and/or County participate by sitting on the PLIB).*

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Marilyn Smith questioned the validity of the proposal that Tony gave. She said that he was supposed to bring three options to the table and the only one he brought was chemicals.

Rick Schweller told the PLIB that he was not threatening them but drawing a line in the sand that if they did not have a plan in place by January 10, 2012 to start treating the lake next spring then FoPL would launch a program to organize anyone who wanted to self treat their bottom lands. Jim said that we should have a plan in place by then – if not then he would not blame us. Rick told them that we have a letter from the State stating that this was our right and no one could stop us from self treating.

John Beeson challenged the LIB to make the trip to Indian Lake to see for themselves what we saw and learned. Jim said that he would go and would even drive and that either Elaine or Paul should accompany them.

Deb Irwin stated that she sees this trip as a good thing and maybe it will be the starting point for the community to begin to heal.

Jennifer Jones attended the meeting and at the end refuted the negative things that Tony Groves was saying about Laminar Flow.

Jim said that the next meeting would be the second Wednesday of October at which time Cathy said that we could not wait that long and suggested that we meet in two weeks – after the Board members have a chance to go to Indian Lake. The next meeting will be Thursday, September 29th at 7:00 P.M.